



UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20460

OFFICE OF
PREVENTION, PESTICIDES
AND TOXIC SUBSTANCES

Certified Mail Z 069 410 550

Wendy A. McCombie
Lewis and Harrison
U.S. Agent for Troy Chemical Company, Ltd.
122 C Street, NW, Suite 740
Washington, D.C. 20001

Subject: Inclusion of Carbendazim Exposure and Risk Estimates in Benomyl and Thiophanate Methyl Reregistration Eligibility Decisions.

Dear Ms. McCombie:

The Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) has initiated its reregistration eligibility review and tolerance reassessment process for the pesticides benomyl and thiophanate methyl. These fungicides are registered for use in a wide variety of agricultural, ornamental, and residential settings. Although the active ingredient carbendazim (MBC) is not subject to reregistration, it is the primary metabolite of both benomyl and thiophanate methyl and therefore exposures resulting from uses of MBC will be evaluated in connection with reregistration under the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide and Rodenticide Act (FIFRA) and tolerance reassessment under the Federal Food, Drug and Cosmetic Act (FFDCA) for benomyl and thiophanate methyl. Specifically, the risk assessments for benomyl and thiophanate methyl evaluate the risk associated with MBC in plants and animal commodities. In addition, aggregate exposure to MBC resulting from thiophanate-methyl, benomyl and MBC use have been evaluated as required under the Food Quality Protection Act (FQPA). The aggregate assessments consider the combined risk from MBC dietary exposure (food and drinking water routes) as well as non-occupational exposure sources of MBC, including dermal and inhalation exposure during painting activities and via inhalation of vapors in painted rooms.

Since Troy Chemical Company ("Troy") holds registrations for MBC paint, coating, and sealant products, EPA would like to provide Troy with an opportunity to review the MBC risk assessment information that will be used in the reregistration decision-making process. This advance opportunity to review EPA's pesticide risk assessment for errors is an integral part of a wider effort to involve the public in the implementation of the Food Quality Protection Act of 1996. The enclosed documents detail the existing database for MBC, the toxicity studies considered by EPA in selecting the toxicity endpoints for use in the risk assessment, and the risks associated with the use of MBC in paints and other products. Within the next 30 days, please identify and comment on any errors in these documents. In addition, we would like you to inform the Agency of any newly completed, pending, or planned studies involving MBC that would

enhance or improve the risk assessment.

Please submit any error correction comments and information on studies you may have **within 30 days of receipt of this letter**. Upon receipt, we will evaluate your comments, prepare a written response, and revise the risk assessments as necessary. Errors may include mathematical, computational, typographic, or other similar errors. The Agency will also consider comments on errors pertaining to matters of interpretation or applicability of data. On or about March 1st, EPA will release to the public for comment the revised risk assessments for MBC, thiophanate methyl and benomyl. Any comments Troy submits and the Agency's review and discussion of such comments will be included. The documents will be placed in a Public Docket and posted on EPA's Internet site. The EPA will announce the availability of these documents via a Notice of Availability in the Federal Register, and through an electronic listserver message.

After reviewing the EPA's risk assessment, please inform us of Troy's timetable for completing and submitting information to the Agency. This will enable EPA to plan better for the refinement of its risk assessments.

Please note that certain data cited in the Agency's preliminary risk assessment were submitted by the registrants of benomyl and thiophanate methyl products and may therefore be subject to FIFRA data compensation protections should Troy or other registrants wish to rely on these data in support of future registration or reregistration activities. Transmittal of the attached risk assessment in no way alters any such data compensation obligations.

Please send Troy's response and other information, in both printed and electronic form to Deanna Scher, the Chemical Review Manager for thiophanate methyl. If you have any questions, please contact her at (703) 308-7043.

Sincerely,

Susan Lewis, Chief
Reregistration Branch I
Special Review and
Reregistration Division



UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20460

OFFICE OF
PREVENTION, PESTICIDES
AND TOXIC SUBSTANCES

Rebecca Clemmer
Elf Atochem North America, Inc.
2000 Market Street
Philadelphia, PA 19103-3222

Subject: Transmittal of MBC Risk Assessment to Troy Chemical Company.

Dear Ms. Clemmer:

Enclosed you will find a transmittal letter to Lewis and Harrison (agent for Troy Chemical Company) as well as the hazard, exposure and risk information related to MBC use in paints, coatings, plaster and adhesives. These documents are being sent concurrently to Elf Atochem and DuPont as a courtesy. The documents have been screened for confidential business information (CBI). Please note that this information was not sent to J.J. Mauget, the company which holds registrations for MBC tree injection products. These products were not assessed given the unlikelihood of measurable exposures from tree injection uses. Nor was tree injection use included in the residential or aggregate risk assessment for thiophanate methyl or benomyl.

At this time, Troy is being asked to identify and comment on any errors in these risk assessment documents and to inform the Agency of any newly completed, pending, or planned studies involving MBC. The registrant has 30 days from their receipt of the documents to complete their review. We do not anticipate that this comment period will significantly impact the RED schedule for thiophanate methyl or benomyl. Comments submitted by Troy Chemical Company and the Agency's response to comments will be released to the public along with the thiophanate methyl risk assessment and supporting documents around the end of February.

If you have any questions regarding these documents, please contact me at (703) 308-7043.

Sincerely,

Deanna Scher, Chemical Review Manager
Reregistration Branch I
Special Review and
Reregistration Division